

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

CASE NO. 15-81298-CIV-MARRA/MATTHEWMAN

JULIAN BIVINS, as personal representative  
of the ancillary estate of Oliver Wilson Bivins,

Plaintiff,

vs.

BRIAN M. O'CONNELL, ASHLEY N. CRISPIN,  
CIKLIN LUBITZ & O'CONNELL, KEITH  
B. STEIN, BEYS LISTON MOBARGHA &  
BERLAND, LLP and LAW OFFICES OF  
KEITH B. STEIN, PLLC, n/k/a STEIN LAW PLLC,

Defendants.

\_\_\_\_\_ /

VERDICT

WE THE JURY RETURN THE FOLLOWING VERDICT:

1. Did any of the following Defendants breach a fiduciary duty owed to JULIAN BIVINS, as Personal Representative of the ancillary Estate of Oliver Wilson Bivins, Sr. which was a legal cause of loss or damage to him?

- |    |                   |   |  |
|----|-------------------|---|--|
| a. | BRIAN O'CONNELL   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No            |
| b. | ASHLEY N. CRISPIN | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No            |
| c. | KEITH B. STEIN    | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

2. Was there professional negligence on the part of any of the following Defendants which was a legal cause of loss or damage to JULIAN BIVINS, as Personal Representative of the ancillary Estate of Oliver Wilson Bivins, Sr.?

- a. BRIAN O'CONNELL       Yes       No
- b. ASHLEY N. CRISPIN       Yes       No
- c. KEITH B. STEIN       Yes       No

If you answered "No" to all parts of Questions 1 and 2, your verdict is for the Defendants, and you need not proceed further, other than to sign the verdict form and return it to the court. If you answered "Yes" to any parts of Questions 1 or 2, please continue:

3. What is the amount of damages sustained by Plaintiff, JULIAN BIVINS, as Personal Representative of the ancillary Estate of Oliver Wilson Bivins, Sr.?

\$16,400,000.00

4. If you awarded Plaintiff damages, did Defendants prove that they are entitled to a set-off against the amount of damages you awarded Plaintiff?

Yes       No

If your answer to Question 4 is "Yes", what is the amount of the set-off?

\$ \_\_\_\_\_

